CHAPTER IV

THE ANALYTICAL STUDY

The stylistic analysis of western and eastern Indian miniature painting falls under two sections: externally determined by the nature of carriers and internally by the subject-matter of paintings and the character of their execution. In the initial period, the paintings appear on palm-leaf and wooden book covers; in the second phase, the carriers mostly are cloth, paper and also wooden panels. The palm-leaf period runs roughly from the 11th to the 14th century and the paper period from the beginning of the 15th century to the early 17th century A.D. But it must be admitted that both
On a general analysis, it will be found that, in both Eastern and Western Indian Schools of painting, the initial stage was more informed by the heritage of Indian mural painting. The later paintings, coinciding with the change of the carrier from palm leaf to paper, drifted away from the mural traditions and gradually ossified into a distinctive visual language characteristic of the miniature painting. Consequent upon the birth of such a language it acquired the regional accents which, by virtue of the patronage of the two religions - Buddhism and Jainism - gave rise to the two so-called "Schools" of painting, viz., Eastern Indian and Western Indian. This is, however, a highly hypothetical reconstruction of the possible picture. Things might appear clearer if the stylistic features of these two schools of painting are taken note of in the sequence of the different centuries. Let us attempt here to do that.

I1th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The
subject matter dealt with in the paintings is both religious and secular. The religious themes mostly pertain to the representation of divinities of Jainism. The secular paintings represent human beings without any clear relationship among them. They are represented either within a frame or, sometimes, even without it. The faces of the figures are either in the full view or in the three quarter view. The lines are thick, the forms angular, but occasionally one can see the deviation, e.g., an illustration from Nishithachurni manuscript of 1100 A.D. showing two flying figures with garlands in their hands (Fig. 2).

12th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings, as in the preceding century, mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter is religious. The themes pertain to the representation of divinities of Jainism. Figures are drawn on one plane. The main figure is mostly shown larger in size than the rest of the figures. The faces of the figures are either in full front view or in the three-quarter view. The faces have pointed nose, curved chin and the
tendency of the second eye to protrude outside the face-contour. The lines are sharp, broken and joined in sharp angles but sometimes there is indication of the modelling of the line. The colour application is flat giving effect of two-dimensionality. An illustration from Daśavaikālika Laghuṛitti is a suitable example (Fig. 4).

13th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings, again, mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter dealt with in these paintings is religious as well as secular. The religious themes belong to the representation of divinities of Jainism and incidents from the lives of the Tirthaṅkaras. The secular themes represent human beings in the company of animals, vegetal and floral designs. The main figure is longer in size than the rest of the figures, as is shown in an illustration from Mahāvīrcharita manuscript (Fig. 6). The figures are either super-imposed or are represented in full visibility. The eyes of the figures are big but not long. The pupil is represented by a dot. There is no attempt at the shifting of the pupil to
denote the direction of the look. The landscape is introduced. Colours are applied in a flat manner. There is no attempt at colour modelling. It is remarkable that in these miniatures, the western Indian technique has crystallised itself. The drawing is angular, the physical peculiarities, such as the pointed nose and chin and the further eye protruding in space appear. In accordance with the simplicity of the subject, the attitudes and poses are also limited and strictly conventional. The postures of sitting at ease are shown in two variations; in the first, both legs are lowered and rest on a foot-stool, in the second variation, the left leg is crossed on the seat and the right one allowed to dangle.

14th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The subject matter of these paintings is religious and secular. To the limited range of subjects of the first period are now added representations of the episodes from the life of the Jinas and the secular themes pertain to the representation of narrative scenes involving royal or common human
beings. The narrative representations are often elaborate and crowded. The human figures in narrative representations have body in full view. The face is in profile but with two fully visible eyes. The nose is pointed and many a times it seems to jut out of the face-contour. The seated figures are placed on flat rectangular or oblong structures. The body contours are drawn with easy and graceful lines. Occasionally, attempts have been made to represent finer details. The use of architectural accessories in the shape of small pavilion as we see in an illustration from the Kalpasūtra and Kālakachāryakathā manuscript of 1310 A.D. (Fig.10) should be noted. The introduction of animal figures is common. The colours are flat to the extent of being opaque.

15th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The subject-matter, as usual, is both religious and secular. The religious themes relate to the representation of divinities of Jainism and the representation of narrative incidents from the lives of Jaina and Vaishnava deities. The secular themes pertain to the representation of narrative incidents
involving royal or common human beings. The main figure is larger in size than the rest of the figures. The figures are shown in full visibility. The faces are in profile but the forehead is in three-quarter view. The eyes of the human figures are sometimes very long and narrow with a circle-like dot as pupil; sometimes the eyes are small with black dots as the pupil. The eyebrows are very long and often they reach the ear. The royal male figure with one hand touching his chest and the other hand in the manner of giving order or directing something, is a common posture. The sky is represented by clouds treated conventionally. Simple architectural details and furniture are employed. Rich colours are used. Gold colour is freely and often indiscriminately used. The application of colour is flat, e.g., an illustration from Vasanta-vilāsa manuscript (Fig. 61).

16th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings are sometimes related to the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter is both religious and secular. The religious themes pertain to the representation of divinities of Jainism and the incidents from the lives of the Tirthankaras. The
Vaishṇava scenes relate to the Krishna legend. The secular themes pertain to the representation of incidents in which royal or common human beings participate. The illustrations are often labelled; the names of participating characters, rivers and mountains are inscribed. Male figures have exaggerated chest. The eyes of the figures are very large. A particular type of female figure, which later on developed into female types of the Laurchanda manuscripts, is represented. The ends of hair of human figures have a wire-like toat look. The sky is represented by a strip of blue as is seen in an illustration from the Aranyakā-Parvān of 1516 A.D. (Fig.21).

17th Century Western Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings are frequently related to the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter is both religious and secular. The religious themes pertain to the representation of Vaishṇava divinities. The secular themes pertain to the narrative incidents involving royal or common human beings. The figures are short with large heads closely set on the neck. The eyes are fish-like. The second eye has been omitted in the profile representations which are more in number. Example is an
illustration Upadesamāta manuscript dated 1634 A.D. (Fig. 23). Sometimes the divinity is shown with more than one head. The colours have sometimes been applied without any definite outline. There is a noticeable change in costumes. The lines are thick and angular.

10th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

Only one illustrated manuscript is available which belongs to the 10th century A.D. This manuscript is: Ashtasahasrika Prajñāpāramitā, dated in the 6th year of the reign of Mahipāla I.

The paintings mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscript. The subject-matter dealt with in the paintings is religious. The themes pertain to the representation of divinities of Buddhism and the incidents from the lives of the Buddha. The faces of the figures are either in full front view or in three-quarter view. The eyes are mostly not fully open and wide. The lines are flowing and steady. The outline of the figures is done with a darker shade of the colour with which the rest of the body is treated.

The colours are white, yellow, blue, red, black and green. The use of Lapis-lazuli blue and gold is altogether absent (Fig. 59).
11th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

Most of the paintings do not show any relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter dealt with in these paintings is religious. The themes belong to the representation of divinities of Buddhism and the scenes from the life of the Buddha. The faces of the figures are either in full view or in three-quarter view. The main figure is always larger than the rest of the figures. The lines are flowing and steady but occasionally we find deviation. The outline of the figures is done with darker shade of the colour with which the rest of the body is treated. Contrasting colours are used to give the effect of roundness and white colour is also used to get the same effect, e.g., an illustration from the Ashtasahasrika Prajñāpāramitā manuscript, dated 5th year of reign of Mahipāla II (Fig.29).

12th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings mostly do not have any relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter of these paintings is religious. The themes pertain to the representation of divinities of
Buddhism and the incidents from the life of the Buddha. The main figure is larger in size than the rest of the figures. The main figure, sometimes, in the narrative representations, is not in the centre. The lines are smooth, steady and unbroken. The lines aim at plasticity and naturalism. But sometimes the lines are harsh and uneven. Subtle nuances of colour tones, despite their thinnens, produce an effect of plasticity as is seen in the illustration from Ashtasahasrikā Prajñāpāramitā, dated 1148 A.D. (Fig.60).

13th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter dealt with in these paintings is religious. The themes belong to the representation of divinities of Buddhism and the incidents from the life of the Buddha. Buddhist divinities are treated in the same conventional manner as during the 10th, 11th and 12th centuries. The movement of line is elegant, light and full of energy as we find in an illustration from the Pañcharakṣā manuscript, dated Śaka era 1211/A.D.1289 (Fig.36).
14th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

"... there is progressive desiccation of colour-modelling and a lessening of the modelling capacity of the line which, moreover, has a tendency towards becoming crisp, dry and brittle; curves, too become shorter and clipped-sharp and hectic 'western' lines and pointed angles also make their intrusion". The figures stiffen increasingly; they are erect and vigorous, and yet without any substance, accentuating their angles whenever they bend sideways. The paintings of Devī-Mahātmya manuscript, dated C.1400 A.D. belong to this type (Fig.55).

15th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

The paintings, as usual, mostly do not have any direct relationship with the text of the manuscripts. The subject-matter of these paintings is religious. The themes pertain to the representation of divinities of Buddhism and incidents from the life of the Buddha and also the representation of some of the incarnations of Vishnu. The faces of the figures are often in profile with double chin, further extended eye, and angularity of the limbs. Buddhist divinities
are shown mostly under arched frames or decorated shrines. The lines are often broken and angular. The colours red, green, yellow, and white - are applied in flat manner.

16th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

The themes are as in the preceding century. The faces of the figures are either in full front view or in the profile. The bodies are voluminous and accentuated by zig-zag lines. The lines are mostly angular. A trend of gradual suppression of plastic conception of line is clearly noticeable. Colours are flatly applied, e.g., an illustration from the Ārṇāyaka Parvāṇ manuscript, dated 1516 A.D.

17th Century Eastern Indian Manuscript Painting

The subject-matter dealt with in these paintings is mostly secular. The themes pertain to the representation of scenes involving royal or common human beings. The human figures are short and heavy with large heads. The eyes are large and lozenge-shaped under highly arched eye-brows. The chin is not prominent. The hands are claw-like and feet are broad and flat. The background is reduced to the minimum. Architecture is treated briefly. Colours are flatly applied and are opaque.
Continuity or changes in the style of Eastern and Western Indian Manuscript Painting of the 10th-17th Century A.D.

The tradition of manuscript-painting which came into vogue in the last few years of the 10th century in Eastern India and in the second half of the 11th century in western India and continued even after the 17th century in both the regions, can be divided into two stylistic phases: Pre-Muslim phase of miniature painting of 10th-14th century, and post-Muslim phase of miniature painting of 14th-17th century A.D. By Pre-Muslim what is meant is the traditional trend undisturbed by the newly introduced vocabulary of painting through the emergent Muslim culture. Once this 'imported' technique and aesthetics got into the tradition of Indian miniature painting, there came in a completely new phase which we have called post-Muslim.

In case of western India, the miniature paintings of the 11th century are drawn in a brief manner. Sometimes the figures are not enclosed within a set frame of line, e.g., an illustration from the Nishithachurni manuscript dated 1100 A.D. shows two
female flying figures with garlands (Fig.2) in their hands, and, in another leaf, some elephants are depicted. In the illustrations from 1100 A.D. Nishithachūrui manuscript, the figures do not co-relate with each other. Floral designs and geometric patterns predominate (Fig.69).

During the 12th century, the artists seem to have preferred to enclose the figures in a set frame. Example is 1143 Dashavaikalika Laghuvrītī manuscript illustrations (Fig.4). Figures are very briefly treated though, sometimes, the figures or their costumes come out of the set frame of the line, as an illustration from Ogha-Niryuki manuscript of 1161 A.D. shows. The faces are angular with pointed nose and curved chin. There is the tendency of the farther eye to protrude out of the facial contour. This feature is, however, not very pronounced as we see in illustration of Jñāta-sūtra of 1127 (Fig.3).

The Western Indian School in the 12th-13th century does not follow any universal pattern; this only shows that the painters of unequal merit existed. Western Indian are being fundamentally linear, these early palm-leaf miniatures lack depth and appear flat. There are positive points also, e.g., the graceful
gestures of the hands or mudras have not yet lost all meaning. The artistic anatomy of the human body also shows traces of ancient conventions. Broad shoulders and narrow hips are the chief bodily characteristics. The chests of both men and women are full; woman's breasts are fully developed and rounded.

During the 13th century, the facial features which show tendency for angularity become prominent as in an illustration of 1237 Mahāvīra Charita (Fig. 6). Narrative representations are introduced as we see in illustration of 1288 Subähācharita. Landscape is introduced (Fig. 9) to give a natural setting to the narrative representations.

14th Century - We find attempts being made by western Indian painters to give a lyrical feeling to their line, even for finer strokes, a Persian characteristic is resorted to and the use of gold and ultramarine, hitherto unknown to in palm-leaf miniatures, is frequently made use of. All these innovations are indebted to the Persian technique.

During the 14th century, narrative representations get dominance. Architectural accessories in
the shape of small pavilions are introduced, as we see in an illustration of the 1310 Kalpasūtra and Kālakachāryakathā (Fig.10). Free depiction of birds and animals is there. The line is sure and swift. The use of gold in 1346 Kalpasūtra manuscript illustrations is a clear sign of progress.

Similarly, in the case of Pre-Muslim phase of Eastern Indian miniature painting starting with the 10th century manuscript named Ashtasāharsikā Prajñā-paramitā, we find that the representation of deity is the main purpose of these illustrations. Deities are represented within a set frame, that is, the main divinity is either sitting or standing in the centre against a background which is either of an architectural design or of an elongated or semi-rounded aureole and flanked evenly on either side by lesser divinities (Fig.60). Attendant divinities and architectural designs are not always there in every illustration. The head of the main divinity was not always encircled by a halo. The lines are more refined and steady than the line-quality of narrative representations (Fig.59 and 27 respectively).
This trend passes on to the 11th century paintings, but now the line shows an angular tendency. The illustrations from the Ashtasahasrikā Prajñāpāramitā manuscript, dated 5th year of Mahipāla II are the appropriate examples (Fig.29).

During the 12th century, narrative representations suggest flexibility in the conventions, that is, the main divinity may not be seated in the centre. The example is an illustration from the Ashtasahasrikā-Prajñāpāramitā manuscript from Nepal, dated 1148 A.D. (Fig.60). Colour tones have the subtle nuances but they are thinly applied.

During the 13th century, we find the line to be light and swift as in an illustration from the Pañcharakshā manuscript dated N.S.385/1265 A.D. (Fig.35) but, at the same time, it is broken and shows nervous energy. This is also seen in an illustration of the Pañcharakshā dated Śaka 1211/1289 A.D. (Fig.36).

The 14th century illustrations show a linear quality which has a tendency towards becoming crisp, dry and brittle. Curves too become shorter and clipped. Pointed angles make their intrusion. The figures stiffen increasingly; they are erect and
vigorous and yet without any substance, accentuating their angles whenever they bend sideways.\(^3\) (Fig. 55).

Post-Muslim Phase—Western Indian Miniature Painting

The manuscripts available suggest that the first half of the 15th century A.D. was the period of maturity of Western Indian miniature paintings. A change of movement which seems to have started in the last quarter of the 14th century took further strides in this period which resulted in the development of painting in two ways: first, an effort was made to bring lavishness into the illustrated manuscripts, and decorative patterns drawn from architecture, textiles, carpets, fill the borders (Fig. 62). Secondly, the illustrations show a greater understanding of the landscape and thus evolve a new style in which the Persian elements in a simplified manner played an important part. Of the examples of this new movement, the Vasanta Vilāsa manuscript of 1451 A.D. seems to be the earliest.\(^4\)

The 16th century illustrated manuscripts show a style in which although the figure and costumes are indebted to the contemporary Mughal style, yet the
older traditions, both in colour and landscape, persist (Fig. 20). 16th century - the linear aspect of western Indian art is there in these paintings of the 16th century and makes itself felt in the pointed nose and chin, but the harshness of the angularity is greatly toned down by the flowing curves of the shoulders and the elbow bends, and above all, by the flowing lines of the drapery. It is remarkable that the protrusion of the farther eye, a characteristic feature of western Indian art, is absent.

The 17th century illustrated manuscripts have a style which is parallel to the style of the 16th century illustrated manuscripts. The influence of Mughal painting on the 17th century illustrated manuscripts is discernible in two ways - first, the way in which the Mughal style is used with a certain amount of simplicity and, secondly, the usual western Indian style which has only certain resemblance with the Mughal style (Fig. 23).

Post-Muslim Phase - Eastern Indian Miniature Painting

Similarly, as in the case of Western Indian manuscript illustrations, Eastern Indian manuscript illustrations reveal characteristics, some of
which are new and others which were not prominent during the 10th-14th centuries.

During the 15th, we see casual representation of the Buddha figure in a sitting position with legs crossed or hanging from the throne. This is seen in an illustration from 1446 Kālachakratantra (Fig.37). Pyramidal shrines are introduced. The line is broken and angular as an illustration of Kāraṇḍavyūha manuscript of 1455 shows (Fig.64). There is prominent representation of the farther eye. These illustrations show a mixing up of two idioms: a vague lingering of the 11th-12th century paintings, and secondly, a general affinity with contemporary western Indian miniature painting.

During the 16th century, we find slow and gradual suppression of plastic conception of line. Angular lines are predominant. The example is an illustration from Chitralekhā-Kāvya dateable to C.16th century A.D. (Fig.58).

17th century manuscript - illustrations do not represent Buddhist themes. The illustrations are represented briefly and in an abstract manner. The treatment of human figures is different (Fig.65). The human figures are short and heavy with large heads.
Points of Similarity Between Eastern and Western Indian Manuscript Paintings

From history, we are informed about the two religions predominant in India during the 10th-14th centuries: Buddhism in the Eastern regions comprising of Bengal, Bihar, Orissa and Assam, Jainism in the western sector consisting of Gujarat, Mālwa, Māṇḍū and Jaunpur. During these centuries, the tradition of book-illustration became popular and came to be known according to their respective regions, e.g., Eastern Indian Manuscript painting and western Indian manuscript painting. There are certain points of similarity as well as of dissimilarity between the Eastern and Western Indian manuscript painting.

The illustrations of the manuscripts of Eastern and Western India show a marked influence of religion. During the period between the 10th and the 14th centuries, when Jainism in western India and Buddhism in Eastern India were the dominating religions, the manuscript paintings of the respective regions were of Jaina and Buddhist themes. The themes of these illustrations are the representation of Jaina and Buddhist deities and the life-scenes and other related
incidents from the lives of the Tirthaṅkanas and the Buddhhas. Later on, when by the end of the 15th century A.D., Vaishṇavaism regained popularity, it equally influenced the miniature painting of western and eastern India.

These miniature paintings of eastern as well as of western India are anonymous and mostly do not bear the name of the artists. Unlike the later miniature paintings of Mughal School and some of Rajasthani miniatures on which the name of the artist is written or inscribed, these illustrations do not indicate any reference to the artist.

Thus, the artist executing Jaina and Buddhist miniature paintings may not belong to either of the faiths. Further, these paintings most probably thrived on regular support of a class of patrons. The artist had to adopt the religious theme as per the demand either of the monk patron or of some rich client subscribing to a particular faith.

Most of these illustrations from eastern and western regions of India do not bear any direct relationship with the text of the manuscript.
These manuscript illustrations do not represent one integrated style in a regular process of development. For instance, if at one time, in one class of painting the composition of which is relatively simple and gives impression of being close to classical style, there is, at the same time, and sometimes in the same manuscript, yet another class of composition which reflects the medieval tendency and so on. So the style of these manuscript illustrations is difficult to be arranged in a chronological sequence. Even if we arrange these miniature paintings in a rough chronological order, such a sequence would not show any stylistic evolution. Dr. N.R. Ray states, "Formally and psychologically they are conventional and inevitably betray a traditional outlook. Indeed, the trend and tendencies seem to have remained fixed, more or less, during the three centuries beginning from the eleventh".

The earliest illustrated manuscript from eastern India so far available is the Ashṭaśāhasrikā Prajñāparamitā (Fig. 59), dated 6th year of the reign of Mahipāla I which is equal to 994 A.D. This is the earliest available example but this may not be the first in the line of tradition of illustrated manuscripts from eastern India. There could be examples of
illustrated manuscripts belonging to period earlier than what is available. Similarly, the earliest example of illustrated manuscript from western India is the Kalpasūtra, dated 1060 A.D. (Fig. I). This again may not be the first in the line of tradition of manuscript painting from western India. Since the style of these illustrations seem to be quite mature and refined, we presume that there could be illustrated manuscripts earlier than these.

The early miniatures from both the regions of India show a marked interest in deity representation. These representations of the Tīrthaṅkara and of the Buddha have always been conventional. In these representations, the main deity is mostly shown as sitting or standing against a background of an architectural design or of an oval or semi-oval round aureole or of a terraced temple design. The main deity is often attended upon by lesser deities. The relevant examples are a seated Buddha from the Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā dated 6th year of Mahipāla I, in the collection of the Asiatic Society of Bengal (Fig. 59) and an illustration of the standing image of Sarasvati from the Jñāta-Sūtra, dated 1127 A.D. (Fig. 3) in the collection of the Shantinātha-temple Bhaṇḍār, Cambay.
The eastern Indian and western Indian manuscript illustrations betray a predilection for heiratic scaling. The height of the figures does not depend on the real dimensions of the subjects depicted, nor are their representations governed by the position of the objects in space, but on the importance of the figures in the composition. An illustration from western Indian manuscript Dasavaikālika Laghuvritti dated 1143 A.D.; in the collection of Shantinātha temple Bhāndār, Cambay (Fig.4), shows Mahavira seated on a throne in the Padmāsana. On his either side stands a chauri bearer, smaller in size. The parallel example from eastern India is to be noticed in the Ashtasāhasrarikā Prajñāpāramitā, dated 5th year of Mahipāla II (1077 A.D.), in the collection of the Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta. The theme of this painting is the episode of the Nālgiri vashikarna (Fig.29). Here also the main character is much larger in size.

In eastern and western Indian manuscript illustrations, the images are symmetrically arranged. The main deity depicted is surrounded by equal number of figures or the same type of vegetal motifs on architectural design on either side (Fig.31, 4). But this
preference for symmetry is not strictly followed in the narrative representations (Fig. 27, 9).

Except the Tirthaṅkara and the Buddha in western and eastern Indian paintings, other divinities are often shown with more than two arms. For instance, an illustration of Ogha-Niryūkti manuscript dated 1161 A.D. in the collection of the Jaina Grantha Bhanḍar Chānnī, Baroda (Fig. 5) shows the different female deities with more than two arms. Similarly, an illustration from the Pañcharakṣā manuscript of 1289 A.D. in the collection of the Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta, shows a female divinity with four arms (Fig. 36). Another illustration from the 1265 A.D. Pañcharaksā manuscript shows a female deity with six arms (Fig. 35).

The Tirthaṅkara and the Buddha are always shown frontally. They are mostly shown without any ornamentation.

The illustrations from eastern and western Indian manuscripts show a marked preference for human figures. Trees, animals are there only to emphasize the domination of human figures. In some panels, more than ten figures, either grouped round the central figure or arranged in horizontal panels, are shown.
An illustration from the Kalpasūtra, dated C.1370 A.D. (Fig.68) in the collection of Mukti-vijayji Bhapḍar, Ujjamphei, Dharamśala and an illustration from the Ashtasāhasrika Prajñāpāramitā, dated 1071 A.D., in the collection of Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta, are the examples (Fig.67).

Then, there are stray examples from eastern Indian miniature paintings where the figures bear a close affinity with those of the western Indian miniature paintings. For instance, in some cases from eastern Indian miniatures we find figures with a kind of face which reveal three-quarter profile with beak-like nose, curved chin and even with the farther eye depicted as in an illustration Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā manuscript, dated 4th year of reign of Gomindapāla in the collection of Bharat Kala Bhavan, Varanasi (Fig.33). In this illustration, one of the attendants seems to have been directly picked-up from western Indian paintings, so far as her face is concerned. Similar type is seen in the Kālachakratantra of 1446 A.D. (Fig.37).

Similarly, in an illustration from Jñāta-Sūtra manuscript of 1127 A.D. in the collection of Shantinātha temple Bhanḍār, Cambay, we find the
figure of Sarasvati Devi (Fig.3) standing in tribhanga posture which is common eastern Indian miniature painting (Fig. 27).

In the later paintings from eastern India, a particular type of linear quality is met with. Here the line is weak and faltering. This linear quality was certainly a symptom of the medieval conception which, with the progress of time, was on the increase. It has to be pointed out that Assam, and to some extent Orissa, showed stylistic exclusiveness - no doubt a contribution of the geographical factors that are peculiar to these two countries.

After the 14th century, eastern and western Indian miniature paintings show new themes pertaining to Vaishnavism (Figs. 56, 50 respectively).

Points of Dissimilarity Between Eastern and Western Indian Manuscript Painting

During the 10th-14th centuries, the tradition of book-illustration became popular in eastern and western regions of India. These two regions are separated from each other geographically. Western India, i.e., Gujarat, Mālwa, Māṇḍu and Jaunpur have very few
hills and forests though there are a number of small and big rivers. But the eastern sector which includes Assam, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa has some hills and forests and also large rivers. Different parts of this region are separated by means of these river-valleys and hill ranges and are connected by land routes. This distinctive nature of the topography of eastern India has contributed much to the apparently secluded autonomous character of artistic traditions flourishing in its various centres. But at the same time, the rivers and land-routes have kept them informed about each other. In the case of western India, such a possibility was more remote in view of the topographical exclusiveness of its centres. Thus, there emerged the so called 'Schools' like the Mālwa School, Jaunpur School etc., in the case of western Indian miniatures. But one can hardly find such stylistic variations with regard to Bihar, Bengal etc. However, the manuscript illustrations of eastern and western India have many points of dissimilarity in the style.

The main difference between the eastern and western Indian miniature painting is in the linear quality. In western Indian illustration, lines are flatly drawn in thick or thin strokes. These are not
drawn in one sweep, but are joined with pointed angles. Lines are broken and do not integrate fully. One of the examples is Uttaradhyāyāna-Śūtra (Fig. 46). According to Dr. N. R. Ray, "The line in the Western tradition is flowing and pointed, angles are sharp almost to a geometrical point, and though there is the same predilection for brisk and extended curves these are not unoften broken and are drawn without any warmth and feeling or emotion". 

But in the Eastern Indian miniature painting, "the lines are definite and unbroken, flowing steadily and appropriately modelled by increasing and decreasing in thickness according to the degree of the roundness of the body contour", e.g., the Ashtasahasrikā Prajñāpāramitā of the 15th year of Rāmapāla (Fig. 31). Another equally important point of dissimilarity is in the application of colour. In Eastern Indian manuscript illustrations, the figures are first sketched out and then filled-in with a dark shade of colour with which the outline has been drawn. The use of contrasting colours has given a sense of relief to the composition (Fig. 59). The principal colours employed are red, green, yellow and white. The colour-
tones are subdued.

In the case of Western Indian painting, the figures are first painted with colour and then the outline is drawn. The application of colour is flat and two-dimensional in effect. This is partially because contrasting colours hardly have been used with the intention of bringing in perspective in the composition. But the rich, glowing and bright colours of Western Indian miniature paintings have nothing to compare with the subdued tones of Eastern Indian miniature paintings. In the western Indian painting, the colours used are green, orpiment, yellow, white, indigo-blue, Indian ink-black and cinnabar or vermilion red. The use of gold and lapis-lazuli blue was very popular during the 14th-15th centuries. But these colours seem to have been used to give decorative effect. White colour is not used with the intention of to highlight the features of the figures as we find in the Eastern Indian miniature paintings of 10th-14th centuries.

In Eastern and Western Indian miniatures the body treatment and facial-features are different. In Eastern Indian illustrations, faces are treated either in full front profile in case of deity repres-
entations, or in three-quarter profile. These two ways of depictions of faces are more frequent though we do find illustrations showing faces in different profiles. The down-cast look, the serenity of the face, bow-like curves of the eye-brows are the characteristics of these miniatures, e.g., the Ashtasahasrikā Prajñāpāramitā, dated 36th year of Rāmpāla. The effect of serenity is enhanced by the relaxed postures of the figures (Fig. 32).

In Western Indian miniatures, the face is shown in a full front or in profile in case of deity representation, but the rest of the figures have their faces in strict profile (Fig. 17). This latter kind of face is dominated with pointed nose, double chin and the second eye protruding beyond the face-contour. The treatment of the eyes is very peculiar and pronounced in the face. The eyes are drawn in two parabolic curves with sharp pointed sides set on the same level, the eye-lashes being drawn in sharp and extended bow-like curves. Even in profiles both the eyes are shown, with one eye drawn projectedly somewhat out of its context. Earliest examples of this class are a couple of paintings in a palm-leaf manuscript, Ogha-Niryūkti dated A.D. 1161 (Fig. 5) in the collection of Jain Grantha
Bhandār, Chhāni. The eyes are normally shown long, the Kajjal-line reaching up to the ear. In the centre of the eye is a small dot, marking the eye-ball, attached to the upper-eye-lid. The total effect is not of relaxed expression. Instead, the expression is tense, jerky and full of nervousness (Kalpasūtra and Kālaka Kathā, 1452 A.D.).

The Eastern and Western Indian miniature paintings show a difference of costumes worn by the male and female figures. In Eastern Indian miniatures, figures have simple and plain costumes. The male figure may or may not be wearing a chāddar or a long scarf, flowing elegantly down to the knees and knee-length dhoti (Fig. 66), as in Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā dated 1028 (Nepal). Female figures do not wear a sārī, but a short skirt that clings to the body, e.g., the Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā of 15th year of Rāmapāla (Fig. 32). In some illustration, female figures are treated with long skirts which are markedly transparent, e.g., the Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā of A.D.1071 (Fig. 67).

The Western Indian miniature paintings show a marked preference for flowered or chequered costumes,
particularly in the illustrations of the Kalpasūtra and Kālakachāryakathā manuscripts of 1417 A.D. and 1439 A.D. in the collection of the National Museum, New Delhi. The Western Indian miniatures show a large variety of costumes. Generally the females wear full or half-sleeved choli and a straight edged skirt (Fig. 69). But in some illustrations of 1465 A.D. Kalpasūtra and Kālakachāryakathā manuscripts, the female figures wear what appears to be close-fitting trousers, the choli and transparent jāmāh. At other places, they may be wearing closely fitting shorts, patka, half-sleeved closely fitting choli, scarf covering the shoulders and another scarf tied round the hair. In other cases, shorts are replaced by the sārī. Female figures of Aranyaka Parvān manuscript, dated 1516 A.D. in the collection of Bharat Kala Bhavan, Varanasi, wear Odhni which falls out behind the head and which is wrapped round the upper part of the body like a sārī (Fig. 21). Male figures are shown with short or long dhoti with a long scarf. Later on Kuladhar turban was added and more refined figures are shown with turbans, jāmāhs and salwars.
Western Indian and Eastern Indian miniature paintings show difference in the hair-do. Western-Indian miniature paintings show the figures with long hair gathered at the top of the head (Fig. 68). Dancing girls of C.1475 A.D., Kālakachārya Kāthā manuscript, have their hair in long plaits. Their hair are arranged in one, two or three braids and is decorated with tassels (Fig. 49). The men except the monks normally sport beard and moustaches (Fig. 17).

In Eastern Indian miniature paintings, the female figures have their hair in such a manner that half of the hair is gathered at the top of the head and the remaining half is left loose (Fig. 67 ). The illustration of Mahāshri Tārā from the Ashtāsahasrikā Prajnāpāramitā manuscript dated A.D.1071, in the collection of the Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta, shows this kind of hair-do. The male figures wear shoulder length hair (Fig. 66), e.g., the Ashtasahasrika Prajnāpāramitā of 1028 A.D.

Figures in the eastern and western Indian miniature paintings are differently ornamented. Western Indian miniatures indicate deep interest in heavy and elaborate jewellery. The figures are 'decorated' from
head to toe with all kinds of jewellery, particularly if the figure is of royal status (Fig. 15). This tendency was at its climax during and after the 15th century. In the early examples also, elaborate jewellery was in use but not to this extent.

In eastern Indian manuscript illustration, the figures are not 'decorated' with jewellery but are shown with simple ornaments (Fig. 33). The royal figures are treated with fitting and necessary ornaments. The illustration of Mahā-Mayūrī from the Ashtasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā, dated 9th year of reign of Rāmapāla, in the collection of the Bharat Kala Bhavan, Varanasi, shows (Fig. 30) a chaste use of ornaments.

The tradition of eastern and western Indian manuscript paintings reached its climax in different periods. Eastern Indian miniature paintings ceased to grow and develop beyond the 13th century when the penetration of the powerful Islam told heavily on Buddhist manuscript painting in such a way that even the artists and craftsmen had to migrate to other places in order to continue with their vocation.
The western Indian tradition of manuscript painting was fortunate. The art tradition of manuscript painting did not decline after the 13th century as it happened in eastern India, but, contrary to it, the manuscript painting of western India was at its best during the end of the 13th and the whole of the 14th century. Only by the end of the 14th century, when a sort of baroque quality crept in, it led to the formalisation of the style.
REFERENCES


2 *The Struggle for Empire*, p. 693.

3 Ibid., p. 693.


5 See reference No. 19, Chapter I.

6 Motichandra, *op. cit.*, p. 52.

7 Ibid., p. 52.


9 Khandalavala, K., *Development of Style in Indian Painting*, Bombay, 1975, p. 11.

10 *The Struggle for Empire*, p. 891.

11 Ibid., p. 34.


14 *The Struggle for Empire*, p. 693.

15 Ibid., p. 693.